

# Sublinear Time and Space Algorithms 2020B – Lecture 2

## Reservoir Sampling, Frequency Vectors, Distinct Elements, Frequency Moments and the AMS algorithm\*

Robert Krauthgamer

### 1 Reservoir Sampling

**Problem definition:** Pick a uniformly random item from the stream.

**Reservoir Sampling [Vitter, 1985]:**

1. Init:  $s = \text{null}$
2. Update: When the next item  $\sigma_j$  is read, toss a biased coin and with probability  $1/j$  let  $s = \sigma_j$  in the stream (note we need to maintain  $j$ )
3. Output:  $s$

**Lemma:** Assuming every  $\sigma_j \in [n]$ , this algorithm uses storage  $O(\log(n + m))$  and its output is a uniform item from the stream, i.e., each item  $\sigma_j$  (each position) ends up being output with the same probability  $1/m$ .

Note that items appearing many times are output with high probability.

**Exer:** Prove this lemma.

**Exer:** Design a streaming algorithm that at any point  $m$  (not known in advance) receives a query  $S \subset [n]$  and outputs and estimate what fraction of items in the stream belong to  $S$  within additive error  $\epsilon$ . Note that  $S$  is given only at query time (not in advance).

Hint: Maintain  $O(1/\epsilon^2)$  random samples and use them to estimate the fraction in  $S$ .

**Exer:** Design an algorithm that samples  $s$  items without replacement from an input stream  $\sigma = (\sigma_1, \dots, \sigma_m)$ . The algorithm's memory requirement should be  $O(s)$  words ( $s$  is a parameter known in advance). Prove that the algorithm's output has the correct distribution.

Hint: The goal is essentially to sample  $s$  distinct indices  $(i_1 < \dots < i_s)$  uniformly at random. In contrast, executing the Reservoir Sampling algorithm  $s$  times in parallel gives  $k$  samples *with*

---

\*These notes summarize the material covered in class, usually skipping proofs, details, examples and so forth, and possibly adding some remarks, or pointers. The exercises are for self-practice and need not be handed in. In the interest of brevity, most references and credits were omitted.

replacement, i.e., the same  $i \in [m]$  could be reported more than once.

## 2 Frequency-vector model

A famous and common setting for data-stream problems lets the input be a stream of  $m$  items from a universe  $[n] = \{1, \dots, n\}$ ; the stream  $\sigma = (\sigma_1, \dots, \sigma_m)$  implicitly defines a *frequency vector*  $x \in \mathbb{R}^n$ , where coordinate  $x_i$  counts the frequency of item  $i \in [n]$  in the stream.

**Example:** The sequence of IP addresses observed by a router. Here,  $n = 2^{32}$  is huge but the vector  $x$  is sparse (many zeros).

**Remark:** In this setting, it is common to assume  $m = \text{poly}(n)$ , hence one machine word can store value in the ranges  $[n]$  and  $[m]$ . The usual goal is to achieve storage requirement  $\text{polylog}(n)$ .

**Example Problems:** Two classical computational problems ask for the most frequent item and for the number of distinct items, which can be expressed in terms of the frequency vector  $x$  as  $\|x\|_\infty$  and  $\|x\|_0$ , respectively.

Suppose we are guaranteed that one item appears more than half the time, i.e., there exists (unknown)  $i \in [n]$  such that  $x_i > m/2$ . Design a streaming algorithm with  $O(\log n)$  storage that finds this item  $i$ . Hint: Store only two items.

Can you provide a  $(1 + \epsilon)$ -approximation to its frequency? Can you extend it to every  $k$  (i.e., frequency  $> m/k$ )?

**Variations and further questions (we will discuss only some of these):**

- $\|x\|_0$  (distinct elements)
- heavy hitters ( $\|x\|_\infty$  when it is guaranteed to be “large”)
- $\|x\|_2$  (reflects the probability that two random items from the stream are equal)
- more generally  $\|x\|_p$
- $\ell_p$ -sampling
- item deletions (turnstile updates to  $x$ ), now even  $\|x\|_1$  is interesting
- sliding window (always refer to the  $w$  most recent items, for a parameter  $w$  known in advance)
- multiple passes over the input

## 3 Distinct Elements

**Problem Definition:** Let  $x \in \mathbb{R}^n$  be the frequency vector of the input stream, and let  $\|x\|_0 = |\{i \in [n] : x_i > 0\}|$  be the number of distinct elements in the stream. It’s also called the  $F_0$ -moment of  $\sigma$ .

**Naive algorithms:** Storage  $O(n)$  (a bit for each possible item) or  $O(m \log n)$  (list of seen items) bits.

**Algorithm FM [Flajolet and Martin, 1985]:**

It employs a “hash” function  $h : [n] \rightarrow [0, 1]$  where each  $h(i)$  has an independent uniform distribution on  $[0, 1]$ . (This is an “idealized” description, because even though we can generate  $n$  truly random bits, we cannot store and re-use them.)

Idea: We will have exactly  $d^* = \|x\|_0$  distinct hashes, and since they are random, by symmetry their *minimum* should be around  $1/(d^* + 1)$ .

1. Init:  $z = 1$  and a hash function  $h$
2. Update: When item  $i \in [n]$  is seen, update  $z = \min\{z, h(i)\}$
3. Output:  $1/z - 1$

Storage requirement:  $O(1)$  words (not including randomness); we will discuss implementation issues later.

Denote by  $d^* := \|x\|_0$  the true value, and let  $Z$  denote the final value of  $z$  (to emphasize it is a random variable).

**Lemma 1:**  $\mathbb{E}[Z] = 1/(d^* + 1)$ .

Note: This is the expectation of  $Z$  and not of its inverse  $1/Z$  (as used in the output).

**Proof:** We will use a trick to avoid the integral calculation (which is actually straightforward). Choose an additional random value  $X$  uniformly from  $[0, 1]$  (for sake of analysis only), then by the law of total expectation

$$\mathbb{E}[Z] = \mathbb{E}_{Z,X}[\Pr[X < Z \mid Z]] = \mathbb{E}_Z[\mathbb{E}_X[\mathbb{1}_{\{X < Z\}} \mid Z]] = \mathbb{E}[\mathbb{1}_{\{X < Z\}}] = 1/(d^* + 1).$$

**Lemma 2:**  $\mathbb{E}[Z^2] = \frac{2}{(d^*+1)(d^*+2)}$  and thus  $\text{Var}[Z] \leq (\mathbb{E}[Z])^2$ .

**Exer:** Prove this lemma using the above trick with two new random values (and/or prove both by calculating the integral).

**Algorithm FM+:**

1. Run  $k = O(1/\varepsilon^2)$  independent copies of algorithm FM, keeping in memory  $Z_1, \dots, Z_k$  (and functions  $h^1, \dots, h^k$ )
2. Output:  $1/\bar{Z} - 1$  where  $\bar{Z} = \frac{1}{k} \sum_{i=1}^k Z_i$

As before, averaging reduces the standard deviation by factor  $\sqrt{k}$ , and then applying Chebyshev’s inequality to  $\bar{Z}$ , WHP

$$\bar{Z} \in (1 \pm 3/\sqrt{k}) \mathbb{E}[Z] = (1 \pm 3/\sqrt{k}) \cdot 1/(d^* + 1)$$

in which case its inverse is  $1/\bar{Z} \in (1 \pm \varepsilon)(d^* + 1)$ .

Storage requirement:  $O(k)$  words (not including randomness); we will discuss implementation issues later.

**Remark:** The storage can be improved similarly to the probabilistic counting. It suffices to store a  $(1 + \varepsilon)$ -approximation of  $z$ , which can reduce the number of bits from  $O(\log n)$  (in a “typical”

implementation of the real-valued hashes) to  $O(\log \log n)$ . A particularly efficient 2-approximation is to store the number of zeros in the beginning of  $z$ 's binary representation.

**Remark:** Notice this algorithm does not work under deletions.

## 4 Frequency Moments and the AMS algorithm

**$\ell_p$ -norm problem:** Let  $x \in \mathbb{R}^n$  be the frequency vector of the input stream, and fix a parameter  $p > 0$ .

Goal: estimate its  $\ell_p$ -norm  $\|x\|_p = (\sum_i |x_i|^p)^{1/p}$ . We focus on  $p = 2$ .

**Theorem 1 [Alon, Matthias, and Szegedy, 1996]:** One can estimate the  $\ell_2$  norm of a frequency vector  $x \in \mathbb{R}^n$  within factor  $1 + \varepsilon$  [with high constant probability] using storage requirement of  $s = O(\varepsilon^{-2})$  words. In fact, the algorithm uses a linear sketch of dimension  $s$ .

**Algorithm AMS (also known as Tug-of-War):**

1. Init: choose  $r_1, \dots, r_n$  independently at random from  $\{-1, +1\}$
2. Update: maintain  $Z = \sum_i r_i x_i$
3. Output: to estimate  $\|x\|_2^2$  report  $Z^2$

The sketch  $Z$  is linear, hence can be updated easily.

Storage requirement:  $O(\log(nm))$  bits, not including randomness; we will discuss implementation issues a bit later.

Will be continued next class.